CHAPTER 2
THE ERA OF
BISHOP DAVID JOSEPH SCOLLARD: THE FOUNDER, 1905-1934

The Consecration of Bishop Scollard took place 24 February 1905, and he held office for
the rest of his life, until 8 September 1934. The Diocese of Sault Ste. Marie extended from Trout
Lake in the east to a point between Thunder Bay and the Manitoba border in the west, from Lake
Nipissing and the French River in the south to the continental divide—the former boundary
between New France and Hudson’s Bay Company lands—in the north.¹ Sault Ste. Marie, the
community closest to the centre of the Diocese, would have the cathedral (Precious Blood), but
Bishop Scollard continued to live in North Bay.² There were good reasons for this. The principal
means of inter-urban transportation in 1905 was the train. Unlike Sault Ste. Marie, North Bay sat
at the centre of a rail network with connections not only to all parts of the Diocese but also to
Toronto and to Peterborough, where the bishop would attend meetings. There were personal
reasons as well. Bishop Scollard had already lived in North Bay for nine years, and he had many
friends there. As rector, he had promoted and overseen construction of the beautiful building
which would be his cathedral. When he became bishop, it was still a work in progress which he
was reluctant to abandon.³ Given the enormity and the importance of North Bay’s Pro-Cathedral
of the Assumption as diocesan headquarters, its beginnings merit attention. The first Roman
Catholic Church in the community was a small wooden structure between Fraser and Ferguson

1. Cadieux, p.5.
2. The Rev. Gregory Humbert edited a journal which Bishop Scollard maintained on a day-
to-day basis (cited hereafter as Scollard Journal); see Humbert’s introduction to Scollard
Journal, pp. xxi-xxiii. A copy of the edited journal is available at the diocesan archives in
North Bay. See also St. Mary’s of the Lake: Pro-Cathedral of the Assumption
as St. Mary’s.
Streets on Main Street West, St. Mary’s. Father P. Deléage celebrated its first mass 21 September 1882, as construction of the Canadian Pacific Railway was taking place. In 1886, the first resident priest—Father J.C. Sinnet—arrived. Scollard reached North Bay 1 March 1896. He had a vision—an enormous church which would serve the needs of succeeding generations. He realized that he might leave his successor with a debt, but on the other hand, he might leave him too small a church. Paying the debt would be easier than enlarging the church. Scollard tendered for bids, and there were thirteen responses, from $41,390 to $58,000. Taillefer and Sons of Sault Ste. Marie made the successful bid ($46,721), and construction began in 1904. John Robertson, a stone-mason from North Bay, put the white limestone from the Longford quarry near Orillia into place. Dedication of the building, then known as St. Mary’s on the Lake, took place 17 December 1905. Total cost—including heating, lighting, pews, altars, and stained glass windows—was $65,000.

Assisting Bishop Scollard were six diocesan priests and twenty-five Jesuits,4 along with the Sisters of St. Joseph of the Diocese of Peterborough. Active in Northern Ontario for some twenty years before 1904, in 1906 the Sisters established a convent in North Bay and in 1921 another, St. Joseph’s Convent, in Sudbury. They also taught in the Separate Schools, and they provided music lessons to children of different religious persuasions.5 Yet, it does not take much imagination to appreciate that in administering such a vast Diocese, Scollard faced more than the usual challenges of human relations and fund-raising. Long train trips were a luxury compared to other forms of transportation. In July 1907, the bishop travelled by canoe from Thunder Bay to an Indian Mission on Long Lake. Throughout most of the four-day outbound portion of the trip it

5. United in Faith, p, 9; St. Mary’s, pp. 75-76.
was raining, and there were portages of two and three kilometers. At least during his stay at Long Lake, Bishop Scollard could live in the house occupied by the Hudson’s Bay Company’s agent, a Mr. Gauthier.6

Scollard’s tenure as bishop coincided with a number of critical events: construction of what would become the transcontinental Canadian National Railway line from North Bay through Capreol and other small communities north of the CPR tracks; the Regulation XVII controversy over the use of the French language in Ontario schools; World War I; an influx of immigrants from continental Europe into the Diocese during the inter-war period; Ontario’s experiment with Prohibition, an almost complete ban on the purchase and consumption of alcoholic beverages which began during World War I and lasted until 1927. (Bishop Scollard dismissed one priest who bought liquor from Montreal—where there was no Prohibition—in containers marked “Sublime Olive Oil”.)7

Before dealing with these issues, it is appropriate to examine the global context of the Roman Catholic Church, whose values Bishop Scollard must have shared. As he began his episcopacy, the Roman Catholic Church was in the midst of a bitter dispute with the Kingdom of Italy, home to many of the Roman Catholics who would become key people in Sudbury, Sault Ste. Marie, and, to a certain extent, North Bay. Sudbury’s Italian population expanded from 78 in 1911 to 2,363 in 1921, then stabilized. North Bay’s grew from 293 in 1911 to 548 in 1921 to 740 in 1931; the comparable figures for Sault Ste. Marie were 1,207 to 2,760 to 3,264.8 The problem had arisen during the long papacy of Pius IX (1846-1878), who had lost his lands. Italian nationalists were intent on unifying Italy whose government would be a constitutional

8. These figures come from the decennial Canadian census statistics.
monarchy, like that of the United Kingdom. The House of Savoy, based in northwestern Italy, would provide the king. By 1860, the only part of the Italian peninsula remaining outside the kingdom was a narrow stretch of land across the centre, which included the city of Rome—the Papal States. Pius IX believed that, like his predecessors, he had a mandate from God to govern the Papal States. Italian nationalists saw the Papal States as the major obstacle to national unification. However, for ten years French soldiers occupied the Papal States and prolonged papal authority. Then, in 1870, engaged in war against Prussia, French Emperor Napoleon III withdrew those soldiers. The Italian army immediately overran the Papal States, which became part of Italy, with Rome the national capital.

Pius IX was furious and warned Italians who wanted to remain faithful communicants of the Church to abstain from political activity in Italy. Those who voted risked excommunication. Pius IX also declared that he would remain a prisoner of his palace, the Vatican, to protest the seizure of his territory. Until 1929, Pius IX’s successors followed his example and conducted themselves as though confined to the Vatican. In Ireland, Roman Catholicism was what separated those who considered themselves Irish from those who considered themselves loyal subjects of the British Crown. In Italy, Roman Catholicism was antithetical to the national identity.

Pius IX had other ideas which would create problems for later generations. On 8 December 1854 he issued his Syllabus of Errors, which summarized what he considered prevalent false assumptions of the day. Among those errors were religious equality (freedom of religion) and democracy. Truth and error, Pius IX believed, were not equal, and as Roman Catholicism was true, other persuasions logically had to be false. To Pius IX democracy—the idea that ordinary people could select their rulers—was blasphemy. How dare mere subjects reject
leaders chosen by God in favour of those who could win popularity contests? Born in 1862 into a family whose ancestors had left Ireland in 1825, David Joseph Scollard was a teenager when Pius IX died in 1878.

In 1882, four years into the papacy of Leo XIII (1878-1903), Scollard entered St. Michael’s College, on the campus of the University of Toronto. His ordination eight years later took place during the papacy of Leo XIII. Leo XIII has a reputation as a proponent of scholarship and social justice. He was the pope who opened the Vatican Archives to legitimate scholars of any religious persuasion. Leo’s encyclical of 1885, *Immortale Dei*, said that governments should be judged on their accomplishments, not on their structures. In other words, democracies were all right if their legislation was good. His encyclical of 1891, *Rerum Novarum*, sympathized with the poor, encouraged employers to pay appropriate wages, and saw merit in labour unions and, if necessary, strikes. Leo XIII also gained a reputation as a mediator. In 1885, the Spanish and German governments asked him to mediate a territorial dispute about ownership of the Caroline Islands in the Pacific Ocean. In 1899, the Russian and Dutch monarchs, neither of them a Roman Catholic, asked Leo’s assistance in bringing European nations to a common negotiating table where they could discuss ways of preserving world peace. He was the first pope who referred to Protestants and Orthodox Christians as “separated brethren”, not as “heretics” or “schismatics”. Yet, Leo remained, to a certain extent at least, a product of his era. He instructed Italians not to vote in the elections of their illegitimate nation. Those overly fond of democracy he accused of “Americanism”. As far as he was concerned, the Anglican priesthood was

---

“absolutely null and void”. 12

Education and the Church:

It was Pius X (1903-1914) who appointed Scollard a bishop. The humble son of a letter carrier and a seamstress, Pius X promoted prayer and piety. He encouraged study of the catechism and faithful attendance at mass. Before this papacy, children usually received their First Communion at the age of eleven. He encouraged seven-year-olds to participate, and the practice of white dresses, gifts, and family dinners when First Communicants initially took the sacrament dates from this reign. Pius also encouraged the very young to go to Confession. Theologically Pius X was highly conservative, and toward the end of his reign (years after Scollard had become a bishop) discouraged attempts to reconcile traditional theology with more recent discoveries and thinking. The pope insisted that clergy and teachers must take a public oath to teach the traditional beliefs, and some who did not remain on the straight and narrow lost their jobs. Pius X was publicly hostile to France’s Third Republic, the constitutional arrangement—a democratic one—which France had between 1870 and 1940. Pius XII (1939-1958) would canonize Pius X as a saint. 13

Pius X’s fears about higher theological education appear to have had few if any repercussions in the Diocese of Sault Ste. Marie, where there was no post-secondary theological education. For his part, Bishop Scollard strongly supported education, and North Bay’s Scollard Hall—a secondary school for young men until recent years when it began to admit women—dates from 1930. An opportunity for a girls’ school presented itself only a stone’s throw from the Pro-Cathedral when authorities closed the Grand Union Hotel in 1920 for violations of the Ontario

13. Cahill, pp. 90-91; Cornwell, pp. 33-40
Temperance Act (Prohibition). The Church purchased the building and converted it into a boarding school operated by the Sisters of St. Joseph. Originally called St. Joseph’s, in 1945 it became St. Mary’s Academy, which made a significant contribution to North Bay’s cultural life. Generations of children, not all of them Roman Catholic, took piano lessons at St. Mary’s Academy. Demand for the school was such that in 1923 the Diocese added another wing. Separate Schools, the name then used for publicly funded Roman Catholic schools, proliferated across the Diocese, beginning with St. Mary’s in North Bay in 1905. (It subsequently evolved into St. Mary’s Commercial Academy, which served the community until 1971.)

On 6 June 1920, Bishop Scollard ordained the Rev. E.E. Bunyan at St. Mary’s Pro-Cathedral. Father Bunyan set two precedents. He was the first priest born in the Diocese to become a secular priest (rather than a member of a religious order), and he was the first priest to be ordained by the Bishop of Sault Ste. Marie.

In 1914-1915, two schools for First Nations children opened at Spanish. A Boarding School for boys operated by Jesuits and a Boarding School for Girls operated by the Daughters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary replaced older structures at Wikwemikong. Bishop Scollard blessed them 11 and 12 June respectively. At Fort William, the Diocese operated a combined orphanage/boarding school, St. Joseph’s, which in 1926 suffered extensive water damage as a result of a fire. Happily, the Sisters of St. Joseph managed to lead all the children to safety.

More on Vatican Policies:

As the quarrels between Pius X and the Third Republic would have consequences in the Diocese

---

17. Scollard Journal, p. 44.
of Sault Ste. Marie during World War II, they require some elaboration here. In 1801, France’s leader, the first Napoleon (who would take the title Emperor Napoleon I in 1804), concluded a Concordat with Pope Pius VII (1800-1823). Briefly, the Concordat arranged that the French government would select bishops and archbishops, who would assume office after confirmation by the papacy. The French government would pay the clergy’s salaries.\textsuperscript{19} In the 1880s, France secularized public education. French education would be religiously neutral. In 1904, French President Loubet visited King Umberto I of Italy. Pius X protested the visit to the head of state of the country which had overrun the Papal States. The French government recalled its ambassador from the Vatican, and later that year, the French National Assembly abrogated the Concordat of 1801. Legislation of November 1904 totally separated Church and State in France. The French government renounced its right to nominate bishops, but at the same time it said that no longer would it pay the clergy. Henceforth they must manage on what their parishioners gave them. The French government seized Church property.\textsuperscript{20}

Scollard also served under two other popes, Benedict XV (1914-1922) and Pius XI (1922-1939). Like Pius IX, Leo XIII, and Pius X, Benedict XV was an Italian. World War I had begun one month before 3 September 1914, when the College of Cardinals chose him as successor to the deceased Pius X. Italy was still neutral, and cardinals from countries on either side of the conflict were able to participate in the conclave in Rome. The thought of Belgian, French, and Italian Roman Catholics killing Roman Catholics from Germany and the Austro-Hungarian Empire sickened Benedict, and he took two decisive steps, the second of which succeeded. Step #1 was a series of fruitless attempts to mediate between the two sides, to find

\textsuperscript{19} For a description of the context of the 1801 Concordat and more extensive information on its contents, see Duffy, pp. 260-265.
\textsuperscript{20} For information about Pius X, see Duffy, pp. 319-333.
some way of stopping the bloodshed. Unfortunately, people on both sides believed strongly in their causes and often felt angry that Benedict did not use his influence to undermine the other side. Step #2 was a series of successful steps to help prisoners-of-war. There was, of course, a network of bishops across Europe—in Allied countries, throughout the German and Austro-Hungarian Empires, and in neutral countries such as Switzerland. The bishops directed priests who could speak the languages of the POWs to establish communications between the captured soldiers and their families. One of the key Vatican negotiators was the future Pope Pius XII (1939-1958), Cardinal Pacelli. Even historian John Cornwall, a critic of Pius XII, credits him with arranging the repatriation of approximately 65,000 wounded POWs even while the war continued. 21 Benedict’s neutrality is certainly understandable. Although few contemporaries would have agreed, World War I was not a struggle between good and evil in the sense that World War II would be. The governments of Germany and the Austro-Hungarian Empire certainly made some serious mistakes, but arguably they were morally superior to those of such Allies as Serbia or Czarist Russia. Kaiser Wilhelm II of Germany and Emperor Franz Joseph II of the Austro-Hungarian Empire certainly had more in common with the people whom they were fighting than they would have with Adolf Hitler.

The principal development of Pius XI’s reign during the life of Bishop Scollard was settlement of the dispute with the Kingdom of Italy. In 1922, with assistance from King Victor Emmanuel III, Mussolini became dictator of Italy (Il Duce), a position which he would retain until 1943. Freed from the bother of dealing with Italian public opinion, which elected politicians had been unable to ignore, he could make concessions which his predecessors could not. In 1929,

21. For more information about Benedict XV, see Duffy, pp. 333-335. See also Cornwell, p. 60; and David Alvarez, Spies in the Vatican: Espionage and Intrigue from Napoleon to the Holocaust (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2002), pp. 85-190.
the papacy and Mussolini’s government concluded the Lateran Treaty. The papacy renounced control of the Papal States which it had lost in 1870, apart from Vatican City (108.7 acres) surrounded by the rest of Rome; the pope’s summer residence at Castel Gandolfo; and certain buildings within Rome. Vatican City would be an independent nation, where the pope would be head of government. In return, Italy would provide financial compensation for the lost territories, and on certain questions of morality (such as marriage and divorce), Church law would be Italian law. Roman Catholic doctrine would be part of the curriculum in government-sponsored schools. Pius XI described Mussolini as “a man sent by Providence.” However, Pius XI’s thoughts on Fascism and Mussolini would become more negative over the following decade. The relationship between the Vatican and Mussolini would cause problems for Bishop Scollard’s successor but not for Bishop Scollard himself.

**The Canadian Challenge within the Diocese:**

Inside the Diocese of Sault Ste. Marie, Bishop Scollard needed all the diplomatic skills he could muster. Ontario-born but of Irish descent, he headed a Diocese in which French Canadians were a decisive majority. One estimate is that when Pius X created the Diocese in 1904, it included some 5000 Roman Catholics from the First Nations peoples and 26,064 of European extraction. Of these, 20,090 were French Canadians. By 1911, the year of the first Canadian census after creation of the Diocese, French Canadians numbered 24,470 of the 37,875 Euro-Canadian Roman Catholics. Indeed, French Canadian migration along the rail lines from Quebec into Northern Ontario was sufficiently large in the early years of the twentieth century that a number of anglophones became concerned that Ontario might lose its identity as an

---

English-speaking province. Interprovincial migration was a Canadian birthright and therefore unstoppable. In response, militant anglophones—including members of the Orange Order but also Roman Catholics of Irish extraction including, most notably, Michael Fallon, the Bishop of London—demanded that Franco-Ontarians be anglicized and assimilated. This was to be accomplished by the banning of French as a language of instruction in Ontario schools, even when teachers and young people communicated most effectively in that language. Responding to the pressure, the Conservative government of Premier James Pliny Whitney (1905-1914) enacted Regulation XVII, which did just that in 1912.24

Bishop Scollard found himself swept into the French-English dispute. In view of the demographics of the Diocese, overwhelmingly French-speaking, some thought it inappropriate that Rome should attach the Diocese of Sault Ste. Marie to the Province of Kingston (rather than Ottawa) and appoint an English-speaking bishop of Irish extraction. Scollard then won himself no popularity among francophones by supporting Regulation XVII, which he reportedly called “just and equitable”. Other Ontario bishops of Irish extraction agreed, most notably William A. MacDonnell of Alexandria (another largely francophone Diocese), along with the Rev. A.E. Burke-President of the Catholic Church Extension Society.

From today’s perspective, the actions of Bishops Fallon, MacDonnell, and Scollard and of Father Burke appear incredibly insensitive, but their background helps to explain their stand. Throughout most of Ireland, the Irish had abandoned their language in favour of English, yet retained their faith. Undoubtedly Bishops Fallon, MacDonnell, and Scollard believed that the

assimilation of French Canadians would make the Church more efficient and less controversial in the larger Ontario society, without weakening anyone’s religious commitment. That said, historian Robert Choquette, an authority on Canadian religious history and the history of French-Canadians outside Quebec, is particularly harsh on Bishop Scollard. According to Choquette, Bishop Scollard ridiculed individual French Canadians from the pulpit of the Pro-Cathedral of the Assumption, surrounded himself with Irish priests, and marginalized French-speaking clergy. Where possible, he appointed Irish priests to succeed French Canadian ones. When numbers warranted the division of Sudbury’s Ste Anne des Pins into French-speaking Ste Anne and English-speaking St. Joseph (now Christ the King), Bishop Scollard antagonized the francophones by holding them responsible for a disproportionate share of the costs. In 1919, parishioners appealed over the head of Bishop Scollard directly to Rome, but in vain.25

In November 1919, the Rev. Charles Langlois of Sturgeon Falls died, and the bishop conducted his funeral mass 19 November. The next day, the Ottawa newspaper Le Droit, Ontario’s largest French-language newspaper, gave front page coverage to Father Langlois=death which, it said, was a tremendous loss to French Canada. Bishop Scollard objected to speculation that in the light of his phobia about French Canadians, he would probably appoint an Irish priest to succeed Father Langlois, and he blamed Le Droit for the speculation. After all, he had defended Franco-Ontarians from accusations that they had failed to respond in adequate numbers for military service during World War I.26 (In this he was certainly correct. The Canadian-born were less likely to volunteer for military service than were immigrants, and most


Franco-Ontarians were Canadian-born. Also, farmers were less likely to volunteer than city dwellers, and many Franco-Ontarians were farmers.) First, Bishop Scollard circulated a letter to be read in all parishes of the Diocese in which he denied *Le Droit*’s charges. Then he sued *Le Droit* for libel. Early in 1920, the Vatican’s envoy to Canada—Apostolic Delegate Di Maria—summoned Bishop Scollard to Ottawa for a face-to-face meeting with *Le Droit*’s editor. The Apostolic Delegate and the Archbishop of Ottawa also attended the meeting. As a result of the talks, *Le Droit* apologized and agreed to publish Bishop Scollard’s pastoral letter, and Bishop Scollard dropped the lawsuit.27

Bishop Scollard accepted the need for French-language parishes, but he made it clear that language of preference, not heredity, should determine who would go where. By 1913, St. Mary’s Pro-Cathedral in North Bay had too many families for the number of Masses offered. At that time, priests used both of Canada’s official languages at each Mass—a phenomenon less than satisfactory to many. There were two possible solutions. Either there must be more services, or there must be separate parishes. The Diocese resolved the problem by purchasing land on Wyld Street and erecting St. Vincent de Paul. Henceforth, English would be the language of St. Mary’s, French of St. Vincent de Paul, and families would choose whichever they preferred.28 Similar conditions applied in Sudbury in 1917 when anglophones agreed that Ste Anne’s should be a French-language parish and began what would be St. Joseph’s (later Christ the King)29. Parishioners in Sault Ste. Marie played by the same rules when the anglophones of St. Ignatius persuaded Bishop Scollard that they needed their own church.30

**Sudbury Acquires a Grotto:**

28. Scollard Journal, p. 34.
One of the most interesting lay people in the Diocese during the era of Bishop Scollard was Frédéric Romanet du Caillaud, the so-called Count of Sudbury. Born in 1847 of the French nobility, Romanet came to Sudbury several times between 1902 and 1914, because of its mineral wealth. A religious man, he thought the area around Sudbury’s Lourdes Street reminded him of Lourdes, France, a pilgrimage centre in the Pyrenees. Between 1907 and 1909, he undertook construction of the grotto of Notre-Dame-de-Lourdes on the rocky cliff above Lourdes Street. In recent years, maintenance of that grotto has been a labour of love for Ernie Savard, a Sudbury businessman in the cleaning business. Masses take place outdoors at the grotto on special occasions.31

**Church Extension:**

Parishes which began in Bishop Scollard’s era included Notre-Dame-de-Lourdes, Alban (1934); Ste-Thérèse-d’Avila (1906); St. Alphonsus, Callander (1924); Our Lady of Peace, Capreol (1919); St.-François-Xavier (1925); Notre-Dame-de-la-Merci, Coniston (1913); Our Lady of the Highway, Cutler (1910); St.-Jacques, Hanmer (1905); St. Bonaventure, Killarney (1905); Notre-Dame-de-la-Visitation, Lavigne (1914); St. Bernard, Little Current (1905); St.-Marc, Markstay (1928); St.-David, Noëlville (1905); St. Rita, North Bay (1908); St.-Vincent-de-Paul, North Bay (1914); Blessed Sacrament, Sault Ste. Marie (1920); Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Sault Ste. Marie (1910); St.-Sébastien, Spanish (1928); Christ the King, Sudbury (1917); St.-Jean-de-Brébeuf, Sudbury (1930).32

The First Council of the Knights of Columbus within the Diocese (Council 932) began in Sault Ste. Marie itself in 1904, in North Bay the following year, and eighteen others followed in

---

short order. The men in the Knights of Columbus have raised funds through picnics, parish breakfasts, bingos, turkey stags, and ticket sales. The funds have gone to the Sisters of the Precious Blood, secondary schools within the Diocese, unwed mothers, Birthright and Vita Way, and Christmas baskets for distribution to the poor. On the eve of World War I, the Diocese found $125,000 for construction of a new fireproof wing of St. Joseph’s Hospital in North Bay. The Catholic Women’s League, launched in England, came to Canada in 1920 and by 1921 had branches in North Bay, Sudbury, Copper Cliff, and Sault Ste. Marie.34

The Diocese also helped finance missions in China. In 1926, a priest from the China Mission Seminary made fund-raising visits to a number of English-speaking parishes. Language problems prevented him from making the same appeal in the French ones.35

It was during Bishop Scollard’s tenure of office that Italian-language parishes also began to appear. In 1910, Italian parishioners withdrew from St. Ignatius in Sault Ste. Marie.36 By 1913, North Bay’s Italians had their own priest, and the Church of St. Rita of Cascia began.37 That same year, the Italians of West Soo and Steelton complained that St. Ignatius Separate School was not serving them very well, and the Sault Separate School Board agreed that there should be another school in the Italian part of the city.38 There were other Italian parishes in Copper Cliff, Creighton, Espanola, and Fort William.39 Most Italian-speaking clergy came from Italy or the United States, but in 1925 the Rev. A.J. Murray of Sacred Heart Parish in Sault Ste. Marie—who had learned the language when he studied in Rome—became rector of St. Rita’s in

34. United in Faith, p. 13; St. Mary’s, p. 67.
35. Scollard Journal, p. 84.
37. Scollard Journal, pp. 31-32.
38. Scollard Journal, pp. 33-34.
The Diocese served other ethnic groups as well. A Polish parish, St. Stanislaus, opened in Copper Cliff in 1909. By 1922, Fort William had both Polish and Slovak parishes.